

# RUSSIA'S MUSLIM FRONTIERS

---

New Directions in Cross-Cultural Analysis

EDITED BY

DALE F. EICKELMAN

INDIANA UNIVERSITY PRESS

*Bloomington and Indianapolis*

©1993 by Indiana University Press

All rights reserved

No part of this book may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying and recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. The Association of American University Presses' Resolution on Permissions constitutes the only exception to this prohibition.

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48-1984.



Manufactured in the United States of America

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Russia's Muslim frontiers : new directions in cross-cultural analysis /  
edited by Dale F. Eickelman.

p. cm. — (Indiana series in Arab and Islamic studies)

“Originated in workshops held in Moscow and Leningrad in August 1990  
and in a conference held in Hanover, N.H. and Washington, D.C.  
in April 1991”—Pref.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-253-31939-0 (cloth : alk. paper). — ISBN 0-253-20823-8  
(pbk. : alk. paper)

1. Soviet Central Asia—Politics and government—Congresses. 2. Middle East—Politics and government—1979—Congresses. 3. Islam and politics—Soviet Central Asia—Congresses. 4. Islam and politics—Middle East—Congresses. 5. United States—Foreign relations—Middle East—Congresses. 6. Middle East—Foreign relations—United States—Congresses. 7. Soviet Union—Foreign relations—Middle East—Congresses. 8. Middle East—Foreign relations—Soviet Union—Congresses. I. Eickelman, Dale F., date. II. Series.

DK859.R87 1993

958—dc20

92-43844

1 2 3 4 5 97 96 95 94 93

# CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| PREFACE  | vii |
| NOTE ON TRANSLITERATION  | xi  |
| Introduction: The Other "Orientalist" Crisis<br><i>Dale F. Eickelman</i>                               | 1   |
| <br><b>Part I: International and Regional Perspectives</b>   |     |
| I. United States Middle East Policy in the Cold War Era<br><i>Richard W. Cottam</i>                    | 19  |
| II. Soviet Policy in the Middle East<br>A Practitioner's Interpretation<br><i>Georgy M. Korniyenko</i> | 38  |
| <br><b>Part II: Central Asia</b>   |     |
| III. Central Asia's Political Crisis<br><i>Martha Brill Olcott</i>                                     | 49  |
| IV. Islam versus Communism<br>The Experience of Coexistence<br><i>Alexei V. Malashenko</i>             | 63  |
| V. Islamic Revivalism in Uzbekistan<br><i>Abdujabar Abduvakhitov</i>                                   | 79  |
| <br><b>Part III: Afghanistan and Iran</b>  |     |
| VI. The Afghan Revolution<br>A Failed Experiment<br><i>Victor G. Korgun</i>                            | 101 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| VII. Words in the Balance                               | 114 |
| The Poetics of Political Dissent in Afghanistan         |     |
| <i>David B. Edwards</i>                                 |     |
| VIII. Reimagined Internal Frontiers                     | 130 |
| Tribes and Nationalism—Bakhtiyari and Kurds             |     |
| <i>Gene R. Garthwaite</i>                               |     |
| <b>Part IV: Pakistan</b>                                |     |
| IX. Islam and the State in Pakistan                     | 149 |
| <i>Vyacheslav Ya. Belokrenitsky</i>                     |     |
| X. The Islamization of Welfare in Pakistan              | 160 |
| <i>Dimitri B. Novossyolov</i>                           |     |
| XI. Islamization in Pakistan: The Sayyid and the Dancer | 175 |
| <i>Richard Kurin</i>                                    |     |
| Conclusion: The Limits of "Expert" Knowledge            | 190 |
| <i>Muhammad Khalid Masud</i>                            |     |
| NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS                                   | 201 |
| INDEX   | 204 |

"Readers will find fresh and thought-provoking studies: the differing approaches of the U.S. and the [former] Soviet Union to Middle East policy, Central Asia, and South Asia . . . provide grounds for self-criticism and the exploration of new directions."

—John L. Esposito

Russian, Central Asian, and American scholars candidly assess the relative strengths and weaknesses of their respective past and present approaches to understanding political and religious developments in the Muslim world. Richard W. Cottam and Georgy M. Korniyenko demonstrate that much of U.S. and Soviet conduct in the Middle East after World War II was based on reciprocal misperceptions. Martha Brill Olcott, Alexei V. Malashenko, and Abdujabar Abduvakhitov emphasize the endurance of supposedly suppressed or obliterated religious and national identities in the Central Asian nations. Victor G. Korgun and David B. Edwards offer different perspectives on the Soviet Union's failed attempt to establish secular socialist rule in Afghanistan. Tribe and national identities among the Bakhtiyari and Kurds of Iran are discussed by Gene R. Garthwaite. The Islamization of Pakistan is considered by Vyacheslav Ya. Belokrenitsky, Dimitri B. Novossyolov, and Richard Kurin. Muhammad Khalid Masud calls for new directions in the cross-cultural analysis of politics and religion in Muslim states.

DALE F. EICKELMAN is Ralph and Richard Lazarus Professor of Anthropology and Human Relations at Dartmouth College. His publications include *Moroccan Islam*, *The Middle East: An Anthropological Approach*, and *Knowledge and Power in Morocco*.

INDIANA SERIES IN ARAB AND ISLAMIC STUDIES

—Salih J. Altoma, Iliya Harik, and Mark Tessler, *general editors*



Prayers at the Barakhan madrasa,  
Tashkent, May 1990. Photo by  
R. Nurtdinov. Courtesy of  
Photokhronika, UzTAG.

INDIANA UNIVERSITY PRESS

Bloomington and Indianapolis