

The Making of Modern Tibet

A. Tom Grunfeld



Zed Books Ltd.

M. E. Sharpe INC.

The Making of Modern Tibet was first published in 1987, by:

In the United Kingdom

Zed Books Ltd., 57 Caledonian Road, London N1 9BU

In the United States

M.E. Sharpe Inc., 80 Business Park Drive, Armonk,
NY 10504

In India

Oxford University Press India, Oxford House,
Apollo Bundar, P.O. Box 31, Bombay 400 001

Copyright © A. Tom Grunfeld, 1987.

Cover designed by Jacque Solomons

Printed in the United Kingdom at The Bath Press, Avon
All rights reserved.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

Grunfeld, A. Tom
The making of modern Tibet.
I. Tibet (China)—History
I. Title
951'.5 DS786
ISBN 0-86232-481-5
ISBN 0-86232-482-3 Pbk

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Grunfeld, A. Tom.
The making of modern Tibet.
Includes index.
I. Tibet (China)—History. I. Title.
DS786.G76 1987 951'.5 86-29840
ISBN 0-87332-415-3

Contents

Acknowledgements	v
List of Periodicals	vii
Maps	ix
Introduction	1
1. Tibet As It Used To Be	6
2. The Early History	32
3. Early Foreign Contacts	46
4. The Modern Era	67
5. Foreign Intrigues I	79
6. The 1950s: The Honeymoon	104
7. The 1950s: Revolt	127
8. Foreign Intrigues II	147
9. Tibet After 1959	161
10. The Tibetan Diaspora	185
11. The Current Situation	207
Appendix A: The Population of Tibet	218
Appendix B: Independence	223
Notes	233
Index	269

Acknowledgements

At different times while I was working on this study several people and institutions were kind enough to assist me in a variety of ways which I would like to acknowledge.

When it came to archival research almost every organization I approached proved helpful. They included the Department of Manpower and Immigration of the Canadian government, the Federal Police of Switzerland, the United States Department of the Army, the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, and the staffs of the National Archives (Washington DC), the Public Record Office (London), the India Office Library (London) and the library of the Central Intelligence Agency.

I am also appreciative of the kindness shown to me by the administration of the State University of New York, Empire State College. Their patience, encouragement and material assistance contributed greatly to my finishing this study without excessive delay.

Likewise, many individuals have contributed to this work. They have helped further my understanding of Tibetan history by providing documents, corresponding with me, and allowing me to interview them. Among them are the Dalai Lama, L. Fletcher Prouty, the late Lowell Thomas, Hugh Richardson, George Patterson, Robert Trumbull and several Chinese intellectuals and officials who must remain unnamed. Dr B.A. Garside was kind enough to supply me with papers from the American Emergency Committee for Tibetan Refugees while Dr Girija Saklani shared her doctoral dissertation with me and Mr Niall McDermott helped me with information from the International Committee of Jurists. I wish to point out that the willingness of these individuals to assist me does not necessarily mean that they agree with my conclusions, which are mine alone and for which I solely am responsible.

I also want to make special mention of a travel grant provided for me by the National Endowment for the Humanities; this allowed me to carry out archival research in British government repositories.

Others have helped in a different, but no less important, fashion. From the very beginning, Neville Maxwell and Felix Greene never lost faith in my ability to complete this history. They consistently urged me to

persevere. At times their faith in me was the only thing that kept me going. I am extremely grateful.

Even after the manuscript was completed, it was not ready for publication. It needed some solid editing to shape and mould the unwieldy tome into a tightly written, smooth flowing text suitable for publication. It took the skills of Susan Rhodes; without which the manuscript might still be sitting on some dusty shelf.

Additional encouragement and editing came from Larry Jagan and Robert Molteno of Zed Books. Their enthusiasm about the manuscript and willingness to publish the book, despite many obstacles, has also earned my undying gratitude. I am also grateful to Hilary Scannell for her patient and thorough copyediting of the final manuscript.

My most heartfelt thanks goes to those who gave up the most so that I could have the time to research and write this book. Alice, Daniel and Ian unselfishly gave me weeks and months in which they released me from my obligations to them. That is time which can never be made up. I can best show my appreciation and gratitude by being as strongly supportive of their future endeavours as they have been of mine.

Frequently Cited Periodicals

- AA** *American Anthropologist* (Washington, D.C.)
AATA *Asia and The Americas* (New York)
AJ *Asian Journal* (New York)
AR *Asian Recorder* (New Delhi)
BR *Beijing Review* (Beijing)
BIS-USSR *Bulletin, Institute for the Study of the USSR* (Munich)
BCAS *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*
 (Berthould, CO)
CAJ *Central Asiatic Journal* (Weisbaden, W. Germany)
CAR *Central Asian Review* (London)
CNA *China News Analysis* (Hong Kong)
CP *China Pictorial* (Beijing)
CQ *The China Quarterly* (London)
CR *China Reconstructs* (Beijing)
CSM *Christian Science Monitor* (Boston)
CB *Current Background* (Hong Kong)
CS *Current Scene* (Hong Kong)
EH *Eastern Horizon* (Hong Kong)
EW *Eastern World* (London)
ECMM *Extracts from the Chinese Mainland Magazines*
 (Hong Kong)
FES *Far Eastern Survey* (New York)
FA *Foreign Affairs* (New York)
FBIS *Foreign Broadcast Information Service* (Hong Kong)
FCA *Free China and Asia* (Taipei)
FCR *Free China Review* (Taipei)
GMRB *Guangming Ribao* (Enlightenment Daily, Beijing)
HR *History of Religions* (Chicago)
 see **Xinhua** *Hsinhua* (New China News Agency, Beijing)
 see **XR** *Hsi-tsang Jih-pao* (Tibet Daily, Lhasa)
IOLR *India Office Library and Records* (London)
IS *International Studies* (New Delhi)
 see **RMRB** *Jen-min Jih-pao* (People's Daily, Beijing)
JPRS *Joint Publications Research Service* (Springfield, VA)
JAH *Journal of Asian History* (Weisbaden, W. Germany)
JAS *Journal of Asian Studies* (Ann Arbor, MI)
JAOS *Journal of The American Oriental Society*
 (New Haven, CT)
JHKBRAS *Journal of the Hong Kong Branch of the Royal
 Asiatic Society* (Hong Kong)
JRAS *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* (London)
JRCAS *Journal of the Royal Central Asian Society* (London)
 see **GMRB** *Kuang-ming Jih-pao* (Enlightenment Daily, Beijing)
MTTC *Min-tsu Tuan-chieh* (Nationalities Unity, Beijing)
MTYC *Min-tsu Yen-chiu* (Nationalities Study, Beijing)
NGM *National Geographic Magazine* (Washington, D.C.)
 see **Xinhua** *New China News Agency* (Beijing)
NT *New Times* (Moscow)

NYT	<i>The New York Times</i> (New York)
NY	<i>The New Yorker</i> (New York)
N-T	<i>News-Tibet</i> (New York)
PA	<i>Pacific Affairs</i> (Vancouver, B.C.)
PR	<i>Peking Review</i> (Beijing)
PC	<i>People's China</i> (Beijing)
PRO	<i>Public Records Office</i> (Kew, UK)
RMRB	<i>Renmin Ribao</i> (People's Daily)
SPT	<i>Soviet Press Translations</i> (Seattle)
SWB	<i>Summary of World Broadcasts</i> (Part 3, the Far East, BBC, London)
SCMP	<i>Summary of The China Mainland Press</i> (Hong Kong)
TB	<i>Tibetan Bulletin</i> (Dharamsala, India)
TJ	<i>The Tibet Journal</i> (Dharamsala, India)
TR	<i>Tibetan Review</i> (New Delhi)
TSB	<i>The Tibet Society Bulletin</i> (Bloomington, IN)
USNWR	<i>US News and World Report</i> (New York)
WSJ	<i>The Wall Street Journal</i> (New York)
Xinhua	<i>Xinhua</i> (New China News Agency, Beijing)
XRБ	<i>Xizang Ribao</i> (Tibet Daily, Lhasa)



THE MAKING OF MODERN TIBET

A. TOM GRUNFELD

Tibet is one of the late 20th century's great enigmas. Sealed off from the rest of the world for millennia, it has spawned myths and legends which remain even to this day. Modern historians have done little to dispel these myths while adding new ones of their own.

This book is the first attempt to reach beyond polemics by seriously weighing both sides of the argument (Tibetan refugees and China). It examines their conflicting claims in the light of archival material – much of it previously ignored – from Britain, the United States, the refugees themselves, and China.

A brief introduction to Tibetan culture and early history provides the background for a primary concentration on 20th century events. Palace intrigues among the Tibetan ruling elite, Tibet's role as a pawn in imperialism's 'Great Game', and its historic relationship with China are all discussed. The situation since 1950 is examined both internally and in relation to covert attempts by the USA, Taiwan and India to disrupt Tibetan life and bring pressure on China.

Dr Grunfeld's account concludes with chapters on the position of Tibetan exiles, as well as the current situation in the country since Deng Xiaoping's accession to power and the introduction of far-reaching changes in China generally.

Dr A. Tom Grunfeld, a Canadian sinologist, was educated at the School of Oriental and African Studies in London, and New York University. Currently Assistant Professor of History at Empire State College of the State University of New York, he is the author of scholarly articles in *The China Quarterly*, *Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars*, and *Tibetan Review*; and has contributed to *Encyclopedia of China Today* and the *Concord Desk Encyclopedia* (Time-Life Books).

"At last a history of Tibet by someone who has no axe to grind." **Chris Mullin**, author of Minority Rights Group report: *The Tibetans*.

"This sympathetic account of recent Tibetan history is the most authoritative yet . . . superb detail and penetrating analysis make it a truly impressive book." **Larry Jagan**, editor, *Inside Asia*.

ISBN 0-86232-481-5 (UK)

ISBN 0-87332-415-3 (USA)