

THE PROTECTION  
OF  
MINORITIES  
AND  
HUMAN RIGHTS

*Editor*

**PROFESSOR YORAM DINSTEIN**

President, Tel Aviv University  
Member, Institute of International Law

*Associate Editor*

**Dr. MALA TABORY**

Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University



**MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS**  
DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LONDON

A number of the articles contained in this volume  
have been previously published in Volume 20 (1990)  
of the *Israel Yearbook on Human Rights*.  
These are reproduced here with permission.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The Protection of minorities and human rights / edited by Yoram  
Dinstein and Mala Tabory.

p. cm.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-7923-1437-9 (hb : acid free paper)

1. Minorities--Legal status, laws, etc. 2. Human rights.

I. Dinstein, Yoram. II. Tabory, Mala.

K3242.Z9P76 1991

342'.0873--dc20

[342.2873]

91-29431

ISBN 0-7923-1437-9

*Printed on acid-free paper*

Kluwer Academic Publishers incorporates the publishing programmes of  
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers, Dr W. Junk Publishers, MIP Press,  
and D. Reidel Publishing Company

Distributors

---

*for the United States and Canada:* Kluwer Academic Publishers, 101 Philip Drive,  
Norwell, MA 02061, USA

*for all other countries:* Kluwer Academic Publishers Group, P.O. Box 322,  
3300 AH Dordrecht, The Netherlands

Copyright

---

© 1992 Kluwer Academic Publishers

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in  
a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, mechanical,  
photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written  
permission from the copyright owners.

PRINTED IN THE NETHERLANDS

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

International Legal Colloquium on the Protection of Minorities and Human Rights	vii
List of participants	
Introduction	xi

### ARTICLES

#### CONCEPTUAL PROBLEMS OF RIGHTS OF MINORITIES

The Definition of Minorities in International Law	<i>M.N. Shaw</i>	1
Are Human Rights Legal?	<i>A.P. Rubin</i>	33
Can Minorities Treaties Work?	<i>R.B. Bilder</i>	59
Toward a Minority Convention: Its Need and Content	<i>S.J. Roth</i>	83
The Legal Status of Population Groups in a Multi-national State under Public International Law	<i>K. Hailbronner</i>	117

#### GENERAL PROBLEMS OF RIGHTS OF MINORITIES

Freedom of Religion and the Protection of Religious Minorities	<i>Y. Dinstein</i>	145
Notes Toward an Idea: Freedom of Speech and Minorities in the United States	<i>L.C. Bollinger</i>	171
Minority Rights in the CSCE Context	<i>M. Tabory</i>	187
The 1989 ILO Convention on Indigenous Populations: New Standards?	<i>N. Lerner</i>	213
On Being Overly Discrete and Insular: Involuntary Groups and the Anglo-American Judicial Tradition	<i>A. Soifer</i>	233
Surviving in Babel? Language Rights and European Integration	<i>B. de Witte</i>	277
A Tribe Is a Tribe Is a Tribe – On Changing Social Science Concepts and Emerging Human Rights	<i>L. Shaskolsky-Sheleff</i>	301
Protection of the Aborigines in Australia: Law and Practice	<i>C. Shachor-Landau</i>	325
Minorities and Terrorism: Some Legal and Strategic Perspectives	<i>Y. Alexander</i>	341

## SPECIFIC PROBLEMS OF MINORITIES

The Arabs of Israel: Between Hammer and Anvil	<i>O. Stendel</i>	355
International Protection of Minorities: The Soviet Perspective	<i>V.A. Kartashkin</i>	377
Jews in the USSR: A Minority at Crossroads	<i>Z. Magen</i>	387
Nationalities and Minorities in the Yugoslav Federation	<i>V. Dimitrijević</i>	419
Minority Protection in Hungary – Hungarian Minorities Abroad	<i>L. Valki</i>	435
The Rights of the German Speaking Population of the South Tyrol	<i>O. Triffterer</i>	463
Syria: A Case of Minority Might	<i>I. Rabinovich</i>	491

## NOTES

Are Minorities Entitled to Collective International Rights?	<i>F. Capotorti</i>	505
The Protection of Minorities and Human Rights	<i>S. Rosenne</i>	513

## INDICES

Chronology of Treaties	519
Index of Cases	523
Name Index	527
Subject Index	535

INTERNATIONAL LEGAL COLLOQUIUM  
ON THE PROTECTION OF MINORITIES AND  
HUMAN RIGHTS

*12-14 March 1990*  
*Faculty of Law*  
*Tel Aviv University*  
*Israel*

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Yonah Alexander

(Professor and Director, Institute for Studies in International Terrorism,  
State University of New York, and Research Professor, George  
Washington University, U.S.A.)

Gaspar Biro

(Director of Department, Secretariat of Ethnic and National Minorities,  
Hungary)

Avi Beker

(Executive Director, World Jewish Congress, Israel)

Ruth Ben Israel

(Vice Dean and Professor of Labour Law, Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv  
University, Israel)

Richard B. Bilder

(Professor of Law, University of Wisconsin-Madison, U.S.A.)

Yehuda Z. Blum

(Professor of International Law, Faculty of Law, Hebrew University,  
Jerusalem, Israel)

Lee C. Bollinger

(Dean and Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School,  
U.S.A.)

Baruch Bracha

(Professor of Constitutional Law, Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University,  
Israel)

Francesco Capotorti

(Professor of International Law and Director, Institute of International Law, Faculty of Law, University of Rome, Italy)

Bruno de Witte

(Associate Professor of Law, Rijksuniversiteit Limburg, Maastricht, The Netherlands)

Vojin Dimitrijević

(Professor of International Law and International Relations, University of Belgrade Law School, Yugoslavia)

Yoram Dinstein

(Yanowicz Professor of Human Rights, Tel Aviv University, Editor, *Israel Yearbook on Human Rights*, Israel)

Fania Domb

(Instructor, Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University, Israel)

Michael Elizur

(Ambassador (retired); Research Fellow, Leonard Davis Institute of International Relations, Hebrew University, Jerusalem, Israel)

Kay Hailbronner

(Professor of Public International Law and the Law of the European Community, University of Konstanz, Federal Republic of Germany)

Vladimir Kartashkin

(Professor of International Law, Institute of State and Law, Moscow, U.S.S.R.)

David Kornbluth

(Head of Department of Law of the Sea, Legal Division, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Israel)

Chava Shachor-Landau

(Professor of Comparative Law and European Law, Webster University, Geneva, Switzerland)

Ruth Lapidot

(Professor of International Law, Hebrew University, Jerusalem, Israel)

Eli Lederman

(Senior Lecturer, Criminal Law, Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University, Israel)

Zvi Magen

(Senior Researcher, Prime Minister's Office, Israel)

Goran Melander

(Professor of International Law; Director, Raoul Wallenberg Institute, University of Lund, Sweden)

Shabtai Rosenne

(Ambassador (retired), Jerusalem, Israel)

Stephen J. Roth

(Consultant on International Law, Institute of Jewish Affairs, London, U.K.)

Alfred P. Rubin

(Professor of International Law, Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy, U.S.A.)

Benjamin Rubin

(Special Assistant to the Attorney-General, Ministry of Justice, Israel)

Elyakim Rubinstein

(Government Secretary, Israel)

Ilan Saban

(Advocate, Association for Civil Rights, Israel)

Robbie Sabel

(Legal Adviser, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Israel)

Malcolm Shaw

(Ironsides Ray & Vials Professor of Law, University of Leicester, U.K.)

Leon Sheleff

(Professor of Sociology and Law, Tel Aviv University, Israel)

Aviam Soifer

(Professor of Law, Boston University, U.S.A.)

Ori Stendel

(Advocate; Former Deputy Advisor to the Prime Minister on Arab Affairs, Israel)

Asher Susser

(Head, Dayan Center for Middle Eastern and African Studies, Tel Aviv University, Israel)

Mala Tabory

(Associate Editor, *Israel Yearbook on Human Rights*, Faculty of Law, Tel Aviv University, Israel)

Otto Triffterer

(Professor of International Criminal Law and Procedure, University of Salzburg, Austria)

László Valki

(Professor of International Law, Eotvos University, Budapest, Hungary)

Joseph Weiler

(Professor of Law, University of Michigan Law School, U.S.A.; Director, Academy of European Law, European University Institute, Florence, Italy)